

Animal Research Ethics

Prof. Hans-Martin Sass

Email: sashm@aol.com

Novartis Animal Welfare Officer Forum Basel September 2006

ANIMALS IN RESEARCH ETHICS ACROSS CULTURES

Hans-Martin Sass

- 1. Cultural Consensus and Diversity***
- 2. Moral Implications***
- 3. Animal Research Design***
- 4. 6 R's in Implementation Policy***

Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington DC, USA
Institute of Philosophy, Ruhr University, Bochum, Germany
Research Center for Bioethics, Peking Union Medical College, Beijing, China

ANIMAL RESEARCH ETHICS ACROSS CULTURES

1. Cultural Consensus and Diversity
2. Moral Implications
3. Animal Research Design
4. 6 R's Implementation Policy

MORAL AND CULTURAL CONSENSUS

- Ethics relates to Humans, not Animals
- Cultures cultivate/manipulate Nature
- Ethics includes Bioethics

MORALLY AND CULTURALLY GUIDING ASSUMPTIONS

Do not harm an animal for fun,
as it feels pain just like you.

German Proverb: Quäle nie ein Tier zum Scherz, denn es fühlt wie Du den Schmerz

Heaven and Man are an integral One. As a result they are
in constant pursuit of harmony between humanity and
nature.

Chinese Proverb, quoted by Pan Yue, Chinese Vice-Minister
of State Environmental Protection, China Daily, July 27, 2006

ETHICS BY AND FOR HUMANS

- Mohist: do not treat humans as you treat horses
- Micah: Love your neighbor and go lowly before your GOD
- Jesus: Love GOD and your neighbor as you love yourself

ETHICS AS HUMAN SOLIDARITY

- Mencius: doctrine of harmony - benevolence-oriented politics
- Asian cultures: family ethics, community health, enhancements
- Buddhism: compassion with suffering fellow humans
- Ayurveda: protect and improve health
- Islam: 1 of 5 principles: give to the poor and sick
- Christianity: serve your Master in the image of suffering fellow humans

CONFUCIANISM

'All creatures stem from nature. It stresses that
benevolence be shown to people and all other creatures,
extending a spirit of benevolence to
everything in the universe'

(Vice Minister Pan Yue, China, 2006)

TAOISM

'Law of nature the supreme principle governing the universe and human society... believes that harmony between nature and humanity is more important than good relations between people'

(Vice Minister Pan Yue, China, 2006)

BUDDHISMS

'All living beings are born equal and have the right to live'

(Vice Minister Pan Yue, China 2006)

RESPECT FOR MORAL AUTONOMY

In recognition of historical and global diversities in moral values and moral acts and of moral disputes among experts and authorities, the individual conscience should be respected and given a priority moral choice as long as rights of others are not violated.

ETHICS

Ethics

is the reflection on and practice of civilized customs and virtues towards fellow humans, based on principles, supported by cultural traditions, philosophical reflection or religious teaching

BIOETHICS

Bioethics

is the 'assumption of moral obligations not only towards humans but towards all living beings

(Fritz Jahr 'Bio-Ethik', Kosmos 1027(24):2)

CATEGORICAL IMPERATIVE I: KANTIAN ETHICS

- Act in a way that principles guiding your actions must be exemplary for others.
- Do not do to others what you do not want to be done to you.

(Immanuel Kant)

CATEGORICAL IMPERATIVE II: BIOETHIK

'Respect each living being basically as an end in itself and treat it, if possible, as such'

(Fritz Jahr 'Bio-Ethik' Kosmos 1927(24):2-4)

CATEGORICAL IMPERATIVE III: SOLIDARITY

- 'It is You !' (Tat Tvam Asi)
- Do not Kill (Ahimsa)
- Overcome Suffering

Do no Evil

Do Good

Actualize Good for Others

(Three Pure Precepts, Mahayana Tradition)

CATEGORICAL IMPERATIVE IV: HARMONY

- Follow the guidance of nature.
- Avoid extremes.
- Seek and provide harmony.

Taoist Reasoning

We make rooms and windows for a room; but it is these empty spaces that make the room livable (Tao The Ching, no 11)

PRINCIPLES IN MEDICAL ETHICS AND RESEARCH

- Respect for Patients (autonomy)
- Do no harm
- Do good
- Justice

- Minimax Principle

PRINCIPLES IN ANIMAL ETHICS AND RESEARCH

- Respect for animals (vulnerability)
- Minimize harm
- Keep happy
- Justice

- Minimax Principle

GOOD DOCTORS, GOOD RESEARCHERS

A GOOD DOCTOR

'Trust only those doctors who have the heart of humaneness and compassion, are clever and wise, sincere and honest'

(Yang Chuan, Confucian Doctor 1700 A.D)

A GOOD RESEARCHER

Trust only those researchers who have the heart compassion to all living beings, are clever and wise, sincere and honest.

PAIN IN THE ANIMAL KINGDOM

- Microbes - indefinable, undetermined
- Insects - diverse nerve systems
- Annelids - sectoral nerve systems
- Vertebrates - central nerve system
 - Pet Animals
 - Transgenic Animals
 - Primates

GOAL OF ANIMAL RESEARCH REGULATION

- Microbes – protect humans + environment
- Insects - protect humans + environment
- Annelids - protect humans + environment
- Vertebrates – animals+humans+environment.

FORMS OF HARM TO ANIMALS

- deprivation of natural physical and social environment
- factual harm by research design
 - harm to health
 - harm as pain, suffering, angst
 - harm to life
- factual harm by breeding design
 - cultured animal
 - sickened animal
 - transgenic animal

IMPLEMENTATION

- 6 Risk- reducing R's
- Corporate Profile
- Regulatory Compliance
- Communication Competence

SIX RISK REDUCING R's

- 1. Reduce
- 2. Refine
- 3. Replace
- 4. Respect
- 5. Review
- 6. Relate

REDUCE, REFINE, REPLACE

1. Reduce number of animals
2. Refine research design to reduce incidence or amount of suffering
3. Replace conscious living animal with non-sentient animals or materials

4. RESPECT

- Respect species-specific vulnerabilities
 - species related discomfort and stress
 - research related discomfort and stress
- Respect concern of partners and patients
 - to not be involved in animal research
 - to refuse medicines based on animal research or products

5. REVIEW

- Review research locally as well as globally
- Have local as well as global governance
- Include outsiders in corporate review

6. RELATE

Relate animal research to

- corporate profile,
- research experience,
- corporate communication,
- cultural concerns,
- public opinion

RESEARCH ETHICS RISK REDUCTION I

1. IDENTIFY DATA AND ISSUES
 - 1.1. Collect technical (medical) data
 - 1.2. Collect animal data
 - 1.3. Collect value data
 - 1.4. Discuss data relations
2. DEVELOP ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS
 - 2.1. Establish reasonable options
 - 2.2. Refine options using 6 R principles
 - 2.3. Identify risk-and-harm features
 - 2.4. Discuss harm-risk-uncertainty relations

RESEARCH ETHICS RISK REDUCTION II

3. PRESENT PREFERRED OPTION
 - 3.1. Present research risk/benefit in selection
 - 3.2. Present animal harm/risk feature
 - 3.3. Discuss with stakeholders using 6 R's
 - 3.4. Discuss medical and moral uncertainties
4. JUSTIFY YOUR SELECTION
 - 4.1. Summarize reasons for selection
 - 4.2. Review AWC 's review using 6 R's
 - 4.3. Formulate objections to your selection
 - 4.4. Review in light of corporate profile

CORPORATE PROFILE

1. Have one single global profile in animal research
2. Adjust to local cultures and sensitivities
3. Visibility of corporate ethics and identity
4. Share ethics and strategy with stakeholders

REGULATORY COMPLIANCE

1. Respect national and international guidelines
2. Respect and incorporate cultural differences
3. Exceed legal and regulatory standards
4. Global and local corporate training

COMMUNICATION COMPETENCE

1. Optimal transparency towards the public and media
2. Animal research is one essential part of corporate mission
3. No compromise with unreasonable action groups
4. Have open internal corporate discourse and review

We make doors and windows for a room; but it is these empty spaces that make the room livable

Tao Teh Ching, no 11

We make laws and regulations for animal research; but it is us that make research livable